

P#L004X%Q4#LN!#\!UM4\$#N#UM4PRS!QM4L^4LT6!9\!_!\$##^!RQ!QM'!Q'bQ%RS!RPP#%LQN!
on this, I do not think that it would. (Tillemans 2013: 298, Tillemans'
' &UMRN4N[6

Thus according to Tillemans, Kamala la’s view is that meditation cannot
&R^'!R!P#L004X%Q4#L!Q#!^L#_!\$'3T'B!X%Q!4LNQ'R3!#LSW!N'0] 'N!Q#!R&U\$4\W!#0!
0'4L\#0P'!P#LP\$%N4#LN!QMRQ!MR] 'R\$0'R3W!X' 'L!0'RPM'3!QM0##%TM!UM4\$#N#UMW6!
9Q!4N!0RQ4#LR\$!4Ld%40W!R\$#L'!QMRQ!U\$RWN!QM'!0#\$'!#\!34NP#] '04LT!L'_'!00%QMN!
RL3!3'Q'0&4L4LT!QM'!Q0%QM!#\!RLW!U%QRQ4]'!&'34QRQ4]'!4LN4TMQ6!9L!QM4NB!
Kamala la’s position is of a piece with those of Dharmak rti and the
;%33M4NQ!'U4NQ'&#T4PRS!QOR34Q4#L!�'!T'L'OR\$\$W6

!

=>9?@

(/..!

C : IF9G!F6! : E : C

k#0!QM'!9L34RL!N43 'B!QM'!U0#XS' &!N' ' &N!Q#!MR J'!U'0QR4L'3!Q#!QM'!#QM'0!

!

=>9?@<@=>A!CDE9F:F9@G!

(/e!

C : IF9G!F6! : E : C

NM#_!QMRQ!QM'!RPP#%LQ!#\!4LN4TMQ!M'!#%Q\$4L'N!4N!L#Q!\$4&4Q'3!Q#!UM4\$#N#UM4a
PRS!RLR\$WN4N!R\$#L'f!4L!\RPQ!4Q!RUU'RON!Q#!MRJ'!X'!L!R4&'3!RQ!R330'NN4LT!
precisely this issue of effecting ! !UM4\$#N#UM4PRS!RLR\$WN4N!
!TL#N4N6

!!"

FM'!4LQ%4Q4] '!4&USR%N4X4\$4QW!#\!QM'!P#LQ4L%4QW!QM'N4N!4NB!9!QM4L^B!XRN'3!#L!
a fairly commonly observed human failing: even the most well-justified
of beliefs will often have next to no effect on a person's conduct. Such a
failure may perhaps be best exemplified by the kind of case I first took
L#Q'!#\!RN!RL!%L3'0TOR3%RQ'!NQ%3'LQ!4L! =M4\$#N#UMW!O!QMRQ!#\!RL!DQM4PN!
UO#\ 'NN#0!_M#B!R\$QM#%TM!RL!'bU'0Q!#L!]R04#%N!QM'#04'N!#\!QM'!K##3B!Q%0L'3!

(.,!

C : IF9G!F6! : E : C

FM'! 'bU0'NN4#L! SP#00'PQ! RLR\$WN4NY! 4N! R&X4T%#%NB! N%TT'Nq4LT! '4QM'O! R!

!

=>9?@<@=>A!CDE9F:F9@G!:GE!DH=DI9DGJD!

(.-

taught by Kamala la involves a “serial alternation” between philosophical analysis and concentrated fixation on the conclusions of that analysis

ZF4\$\$ '&RLN!+, -(5!+)-[6!FM'0!'0'&R4LNB!M#_ ']' '0B!R!P'0QR4L!#URP4QW!RL3!

uncertainty as to the nature of this ‘so-called’ analytic meditation – a

]RP4\$\$RQ4#L!X'Q_ ' 'L!P#LN43 '04LT!*bh tapratyavek* !N4&USW!RN!L#La&'34QRa

Q4] ' !UM4\$#N#UM4P!ROT%&'LQRQ4#L!#0!N#&'QM4LT!�!'QMR!QMRQB!R!SN%XQ\$'!

\#0&Y!#\!0'RN#L4LT!4L!_M4PM!&'34QRQ4] '!%L3'0NQRQ4LT!4N!SN#&'M#_!4LQ'0a

_#] 'L!_4QM!UM4\$#N#UMWY!ZF4\$\$ '&RLN!+, -(5!+)e[6!

(.+:!

C : IF9G!F6! : E : C

: N43 '! \0#&! X'4LT!R!T##3! 'bR&U\$'!#\!QM'!]4N%RS!
URNNRT'!R\$N#!U0#]43 'N!R!N%PP4LPQ!4L34PRQ4#L!#\!QM'!

!\!4LN4TMQB!QM4N!

!

=>9?@<@=>A!CDE9F:F9@G!:



(...!

C : IF9G!F6! : E : C

FM'!d%R\$4QW!#\!]4]43L'NN!Zsphu atva[!RNN#P4RQ'3!_4QM!QM'!P#TL4Q4#L!#\!
N14L!QM4N!URNNRT'!#PP%ON!4L!R!NQRQ'!#\!sam dhīB!N' '&4LT\$W!P#&X4La
4LT!\'RQ%0'N!#\!X#QM!QM'!P#LP'UQ%RS!RL3!QM'!L#LaP#LP'UQ%RS!ZN'!'!<'W#\0Q!
I% 'TT! -)e)5!)20. B! - e +\6!P\6!F4\$\$' &RLN!+, - (5!+) - [6! : !URNNRT'!\0#&!QM'!
N'P#L3! ; MV!N%TT'NQN!X#QM!LRQ%0'N5

g>hR]4LT!RXRL3#L'3!&'LQRS!34NQRQP4#LNB!#L'!4L_R03\$W!34NP'0LN!QM#N'!] 'OW!
NR&'!UO']4#%NSW!P#LN43'0'3! N!RN!4&RT'N!4L!QM'!NUM'0'!#\!P#LP' LQRa
Q4#L6! @L'!3# 'N!N#!4LQ'LN4] '\$W6!9L!QM4N!&RLL'OB!34NP04&4LRQ4LT!QM'!'&'RL4LT!
Q#!X'!'^L#_L!4L!QM#N'!4&RT'N!4L!QM'!NUM'0'!#\!P#LP' LQRQ4#L!QM#0#%TMSW!
34NP04&4LRQ4LT!P#&US'Q'SW!P#LN43'04LT!P#&US'Q'SW!4L]'Nq4TRQ4LT!\#0X'R0a
4LT!RPP'UQ4LT!P\$RNN4\W4LT!###^4LT!RL3!^L#_4LT!O!QMRQ!4N!PR\$S'3!4LN4TMQ6!
<#!4Q!4N!QMRQ!QM'!X#3M4NRQQ]R!4N!N^4\$\$'3!4L!4LN4TMQ6^1

It is apparent that the discernment of reality was considered by Kamala la
Q#!X'!RL!'bu'04'LQ4RS!U0#P'NNB!#L'!4L!_M4PM!QM'!Q0%'!LRQ%0'!#\! N!4N!
340'PQ\$W!34NP#] '0'3!#0!0'P#TLA`'3!_M4\$'!RX434LT!4L!R!'&'34QRQ4]'!NQRQ'!O!
MR]4LT!X' 'L!%L3'ONQ##3!4L!R!U%0'\$W!ORQ4#LRS!_RW!RQ!RL!'ROS4'0!i%LPQ%0'6!
IRQM'0!QMR!^L#_4LT! ! N!RO'!'&UQWB!#L'!340'PQ\$W!^L#_N! N!
empty. Kamala la identifies this meditative understanding with the
first limb of awakening, the discrimination of NB!_M4PM!M'!RPP%N'N!
M4N!#UU#L'LQ!#\!#\ONR^4LT5!

FM%N!XW!0'i'PQ4LT!QM'!34NP'0L&'LQ!#\!0'R\$4QW!#L'!_#%\$3!QM'0'XW!MR]'!0'i'PQ'3!
QM'!] 'OW!#\0'&#NQ!\$4&X!#\!R_R^L4LT!O!_M4PM!4N!PR\$S'3!SQM'!34NP04&4LRQ4#L!
#\! N Zdharmapracaya[6Y+e

Kamala la does not deny that this meditative understanding includes a
P#LP'UQ%RS!'S'&'LQf!#L!QM'!P#LQOROW!M4N!RPP#%LQ!U#4LQN!Q#!R!34Nq4LPQ4]'!'

LR&'\$WB!QM'40!X'4LT!4&U'0&RL'LQB!%LNRQ4N\RPQ#OWB!'&UQW!RL3!4LN%XNQR!Q4RS6!<'!D\$QNPM4LT'0!
2007: 456 (note 16) for Stiramati's views, and 484 on these features as perceived in
yogipratyak according to Dharmak rti and his commentators.

+1! ; MV!+!E!21R10X+5!sems kyi rnam par ghyeng ba spangs nas ji ltar bsams pa'i chos

། de ltar ting nge 'dzin gyi spyod yul gzugs brnyan de dag la shes bya'i
don de rnam par 'byed pa dang ། rab tu rnam par 'byed pa dang །

། ། 'dod pa dang ། bye brag 'byed pa dang །

dpa' lthag mthong la mkhas pa yin no zhes gsungs so །

+e! ; MV! (! - /6/O15! tath hy anena bh tapratyavek pratik ipat dharmapracavi-

(.e!

C : IF9G!F6! : E : C

! #"

Kamala la's version of the continuity thesis is best understood by gaining
 R!P\$'RO'0!N'LN'!#!M4N!O'\$4RLP'!#L!QM'!NPM'&R!#\!QM'!QMO' '!_4N3#&N6! c M4\$'!
 M'!3#'N!L#Q!RUU'RO!Q#!MR]'!'0'TRO3'3!QM'!P#LQ4L%4QW!X'Q_' 'L!UM4\$#N#UM4PRS!
 RLRSWN4N!RL3!P#LP'UQ%RS!&'34QRQ4#L!RN!UROQ4P%\$ROS\$W!UO#XS'&RQ4PB!M'!343!
 J4'_!QM'&!RN!UM'L#&'L#\$#T4PR\$W!34NQ4LPQ!RL3!O'\$4'3!#L!QM4N!34NQ4LPQ4#L!
 4L!'bU\$R4L4LT!QM'!R04N4LT!#\!L#LaP#LP'UQ%RS!TL#N4N6!C#0'!UO#XS'&RQ4PB!
 \$4^'SW!X'PR%N'!M4N!#UU#L'LQN!P#L\0#LQ'3!M4&!_4QM!4QB!_RN!QM'!TRU!X'Q_' 'L!
 philosophy and non-conceptual gnosis – a gap that he filled by identifying
 QM'!34NP'0L&'LQ!#\!O'RS4QW!_4QM!R!&'34QRQ4] '!%L3'ONQRL34LT!RNN#P4RQ'3!
 _4QM!QM'!QM4O3!#\!QM'!QMO' '!_4N3#&NB!bh van may prajñ 6!

The model of three wisdoms allows for an identification of *bh tapra*
tyavek !_4QM!RL! !O'RS4`RQ4#L!#\!QM'!QO%'!LRQ%0'!#\!U'ON#LN!RL3!

NB!R!O'RS4`RQ4#L!QMRQ!3#N!L#Q!N(!)3(&!UW!P#LN(!)3(N)3(Q)3(!)3(!)3(L)3(!)

but which nevertheless retains a conceptual nature. Gazing at one's mind

!

=>9?@<@=>A!CDE9F:F9@G!:GE!DH=DI9



! =>9?@<@=>A!CDE9F:F9@G!:GE!DH=DI9DGJD! (1-

R\$N#!X'L!P#00#X#0RQ'3!4L!'bU'04'LP'6!9L!QM'!P#LQ'bQ!#\!QM'!3'XRQ'!RQ!

(1+!

C : IF9G!F6! : E : C

#L!QM'!XRN4N!#\!U'ON#LRS!&'34QRQ4]'!'bU'04'LP'!&%N0!0'&R4L!N%Xi'PQ!Q##!
UM4\$#N#UM4P!P04Q4d%'!RL3!U0##\6⁽¹! c M4\$'!M'!3#'N!L#0!NRW!RN!&%PMB!4Q!&RW!
be that we can best understand Kamalas la's epistemological stance as one
#\!&%Q%R\$\$W!0'4L\#0P4LT!U04JRQ'!RL3!U%X\$4P!NUM'0'N!#\!U0##\6!9Q!&4TMQ!'] 'L!
X'!N%TT'NQ'3!QMRQ!M4N!'U4NQ'&##T4PRS!U#N4Q4#L!4N!UROQ4P%\$RO\$W!0'N4NQRLQ!Q##!

c RLT3%B! =RNRLT!RL3! >4\$3 'TR03! E4' &X'0T'0B! '3N6! s !Q0RLN6B!+ , , ,6! dBa' bzhed5
The Royal Narrative Concerning the Bringing of the Buddha
 6! "4'LLR5! "'OSRT!3'0! t NQ'00'4PM4NPM'L! : ^R3'&4'!3'0! c 4NN'LNPMR\Q'L6!
 c 4\$\$4R&NB! =R%\$6!+ , ,)6!Mah y na Buddhism6 Z+L3! '36[! ?#L3#L5! I#%Q\$ '3T'6

Abstract

9L!QM4N!URU'0!9!RQQ'&UQ!Q#!'bU\$R4L!QM'!P#LQ04X%Q4#L!#!&'34QRQ4#L!Zbh van [!Q#!
 ^L#_ '\$'3T'!RN!4Q!14N!U0'N'LQ'3!4L!QM'!*Bh van kramas*. Kamala la's presentation in
 QM'N'!Q'bQN!&R^'N!%N'!#!\!QM'!NPM'&R!#!\!QM0'!'!_4N3#&N!#!0!prajñ N!Z rutamay -B
cint may B RL3 bh van may -prajñ) and a very specific understanding of the
 L#Q4#L!#!\!bh tapratyavek RN!SQM'!34NP'OL&'LQ!#\!0'RS4QW6Y CW!RLRSWN4N!4N!\OR&'3!
 4L!QM'!P#LQ'bQ!#!R!0'P'LQ!P#LQ0#] 'ONW!P#LP'OL4LT!QM'!'U4NQ'&#T4PRS!0#S'!#\!
 &'34QRQ4#L!4L!0'SRQ4#L!Q#!QM'!]4' _N!#!\!QM'!#UU#N4LT!N43'N!#!\!QM'!M4NQ#04PRS!3'XRQ'!
 RQ!;NR&!WRN6!9!ROT%'!QMRQ!QM'!*Bh van kramas* assign a necessary and very specific
 \LPQ4#L!Q#!P#LP'UQ%RS!&'34QRQ4#L!4L!QM'!U0#P'NN!#!\!RPd%404LT!JTJ9.5340'PQ6B!L